

JAN 6 1949



# SIERRA CLUB BULLETIN

*December*  
1948



# Miscellany

Berkeley, October 30  
 EDITOR—C. Edward Graves' letter inside the cover of the Sept.-Oct. *Bulletin* was rather a surprising occurrence, or so it seems. . . . It is to be hoped that his letter is intended to be humorous, although in that case I have missed the point entirely. . . .

His proposal of hikers' trails would make the already well-covered Sierra a network somewhat like a railroad marshalling yard. If anything, there are too many trails now without adding more. The present trail system, while perhaps inadequate in some ways and subject to qualified criticism in others, does manage to allow a substantial number of citizens to see, learn to appreciate, and finally to love the High Country.

. . . His solution should rather be that of being a true knapsacker—one who, with his all on his back, needs no dug-out, carefully marked trail but travels over the landscape at will following the contours by USGS map and compass, and leaving no trace of his passing . . .

T. KENNETH ULYATT

● We thought Mr. Graves intended to be humorous—but pointedly so. Our own feeling, based upon many months of knapsacking and pack-tripping in the Sierra, is that there is room in the Sierra for both the horse and the knapsacker, and that the routes of both must usually coincide. We agree with Mr. Ulyatt that the knapsacker can leave the trail if he feels he must—but not always, and that's where we side with Mr. Graves. The Mist Trail to Vernal Fall is not for horses, and we're glad of it. Stock has been kept off the south-side trail in Kings Canyon; we like that too, and not because we hate horses (we don't think Mr. Graves does, either). We can think of a good many places where the footburner is imposed upon by far more

than the smell of the barnyard—places he can't avoid by cross-country travel because he doesn't know how to travel an off-trail route safely; places in which he must therefore plod on trails engineered for stock that don't like a steep ascent and don't mind getting wet up to the kyacks at a stream crossing. Nonmountaineering knapsackers need a break, and it wouldn't cost much to give it to them.

## Photographs Wanted

Who has photographs (black and whites suitable to reproduction preferred) that show the before and after of mountain exploitation, or, if not both, just the after? Some of the subjects in mind are: Mother Lode dredging, bad lumbering practice, overgrazing, erosion and silting, poor resort development, forest-fire damage, over-extravagant road engineering, the effect on scenery of dam construction or of the drawdown of lakes behind dams.

If you have such photographs, or can get them, or know where they may be had, please write the editor. But don't suggest Ansel Adams or Cedric Wright. By the time they get through with a burned stump they have salon prints!

## Contents

January Morning, Haven Jorgensen	Cover
Directors Hold Business Meeting . . .	3
Bridge Canyon Dam . . . . .	4
Glacier View Dam . . . . .	5
Tioga Road . . . . .	5
Carl Inn Road . . . . .	6
Calaveras Grove . . . . .	6
Olympic National Park . . . . .	7
Far West Ski Association . . . . .	7
Kings Canyon Road . . . . .	8
Mountaineering Regulations . . . . .	8
Bulletin Sales . . . . .	8

Published monthly except August by the Sierra Club, 2061 Center Street, Berkeley 4, California. Annual dues are \$6.00 (first year \$12.00), of which \$1.00 is for subscription to *Sierra Club Bulletin*. Entered as second class matter at Post Office, Berkeley, under Act of March 3, 1879. Contributions and changes of address should go to address above; communications on matters of club policy should be addressed to the Secretary, 1050 Mills Tower, San Francisco 4.

DAVID R. BROWER, *Editor of the Sierra Club Bulletin*; Harriet Parsons, *Associate Editor*; Ansel Adams, John Barnard, Barbara Bedayn, Arthur Blake, Joan Clark, August Frugé, Morgan Harris, Weldon Heald, Charlotte Mauk, Marion Parsons, Vivian Schagen, Blanche Stallings.



... T

## Meet

A reg  
 rector  
 10:10  
 in the  
 Tower  
 presid  
 cept V  
 Oth  
 orary  
 chairm  
 Club.  
 Foster  
 Califor  
 Lode)  
 Wayb  
 and J  
 tary o  
 Adam  
 Dorot  
 bers o  
 Weile  
 Room  
 Mom  
 comm  
 brand  
 ester.

## Elec Vice

At  
 L. Hu  
 rector  
 on Se  
 name  
 posit  
 der re



# Sierra Club Bulletin

VOLUME 33

DECEMBER, 1948

NUMBER 11

... TO EXPLORE, ENJOY, AND PROTECT THE NATURAL MOUNTAIN SCENE ...

## Directors Hold Business Meeting

### *Meeting Called to Order*

A regular meeting of the Board of Directors of the Sierra Club convened at 10:10 a.m. Saturday, November 27, 1948, in the enlarged club rooms at 1050 Mills Tower, San Francisco, President Farquhar presiding. All directors were present except Weldon Heald.

Others present at the meeting were Honorary Vice-President Joel Hildebrand; the chairman of each of the six chapters of the Club, namely, Ed Buck (Riverside), Ivy Foster (San Diego), Jim Gorin (Southern California), Hynton Sharman (Mother Lode), Russell Varian (Loma Prieta), Ed Wayburn (San Francisco Bay); Art Blake and Jack Barnard, Chairman and Secretary of the Conservation Committee; Ken Adam, Harold Bradley, Richard Bradley, Dorothy Bradley, and Helen Verdi, members of the Conservation Committee; Al Weiler, Chairman of the Library and Rooms Committee; Ted Grubb and Joe Momyer, members of chapter executive committees; Joe Brower; Mrs. Alex Hildebrand; Perry A. Thompson, Regional Forester, U. S. Forest Service.

### *Election of Honorary Vice-President*

At the time of the resignation of Walter L. Huber as a member of the Board of Directors and Treasurer of the Sierra Club on September 5, 1948, Kehrlein placed his name in nomination for election to the position of Honorary Vice-President. Under rules previously adopted by the Board

requiring nomination in advance of the meeting, the nomination was deferred to this meeting. Upon motion by Kehrlein, seconded by Bernays, Walter L. Huber was unanimously elected an Honorary Vice-President. He arrived to participate in the meeting shortly after the action was taken.

### *Election of Honorary Life Member*

Upon motion by Robinson, seconded by Kehrlein, the name of Dr. J. E. Church was brought before the Board for nomination as an Honorary Life Member of the Club, his name having been proposed in writing to all members of the Board some time prior to the meeting. Dr. Church had been a member of the Sierra Club since about 1895 and had for nearly half a century been extremely active on an international scale in "exploring the mountain regions of the Pacific Coast and publishing authentic information concerning them," particularly with reference to winter conditions in the Sierra Nevada. Many issues of the *Sierra Club Bulletin* in the first few years of the century carry his careful records of his work in the Sierra Nevada. He was thereupon unanimously elected an Honorary Life Member of the Club.

### *Report on Membership*

The report of the Secretary showed that as of October 31, the date for elimination of delinquent members, the club's membership had increased to 6,076. This was an increase of approximately 200 over the previous year and does not include 34

members elected the following day, November 1.

Farquhar stated that with this continuing growth of the club it was important that new members be fully indoctrinated in the principles and purposes of the club. He raised again the question as to the proper function of the chapters and stated his intention to appoint a committee to draft uniform by-laws to be discussed with chapters and presented to the May meeting of the Board for action.

### *Contribution by Walter A. Starr*

The Treasurer reported to the Board a contribution in the amount of \$200.00 from Walter A. Starr to aid in the educational work of the LeConte Lodge in Yosemite Valley. Upon motion by Lipman, seconded by Hildebrand and unanimously carried, the Secretary was directed to convey to Walter Starr the sincere appreciation of the Sierra Club for his generosity and long continued interest in connection with LeConte Lodge.

### *Nominating Committee*

Upon motion by Brower, seconded by Lipman and unanimously carried, a Nominating Committee was appointed, as follows: Herbert L. Breed (chairman), James L. Gorin, Dorothy Huggins, Dorothy Sandstrom, Vivian Schagen, Freda Walbrecht, Ted Grubb; alternates: Larry Burnley, Andrew O. Porter.

### *Judges of Election*

Upon motion duly made, seconded and carried, judges of election were appointed, as follows: Catherine S. Tubby (chairman), Ida E. Logan, Lila McKinne, Frank Schoch, Marion Schoch, Rosa M. Selle, Charles Spinner, Helen H. Verdi, Ada S. Chaplin, Esther Crites, Roy Crites, Edwin Fox, Alice Higgins, Bessie Lawrence, Emerson LeClerq.

### *Bridge Canyon Dam*

The Secretary outlined the matter, pointing out that on the basis of general principles of opposition to any commercial development in a national park in any degree most of the conservation organiza-

tions of the country had indicated their intention strongly to oppose the construction of the Bridge Canyon Dam, which would flood eighteen miles along one boundary of the western portion of Grand Canyon National Park, plus a considerable area in the Grand Canyon National Monument below the park. Robinson, as a member of the Advisory Committee on Conservation to the Secretary of the Interior, had felt that there were many reasons why it might be best to work out a satisfactory compromise which would gain more in park values in other portions of the park than would be lost along river cliffs on the west boundary. Robinson's views had been expressed fully to the Board of Directors at the September 5 meeting and had, at the direction of the Board, been placed in writing for consideration at this meeting. Honorary Vice-President Duncan McDuffie, a close friend of Frederick Law Olmsted, who had previously made two surveys of the problem, presented Robinson's proposals to Olmsted, who expressed himself as in accord with Robinson's recommendations.

Heald reported from Arizona that the building of the dam was considered absolutely essential for the welfare of the state and inevitable so far as conservation interests were concerned. He felt that the only subject for discussion was the height of the dam. He suggested that at the Congressional hearings in the 81st Congress on the bill to authorize construction of the dam and on the Advisory Committee to the Secretary of the Interior conservationists should try to limit the height of the dam to 1,772 feet water surface elevation, instead of the maximum of 1,866 feet which is also proposed. The lower level would dam the river throughout the entire Grand Canyon National Monument, but would not affect the boundary of the National Park.

Upon motion by Hildebrand, seconded by Leonard, and carried without dissenting vote, it was stated that the Board of Directors of the Sierra Club is inclined toward the views expressed in the Robinson report and desires a thorough exploration of that point of view and recommendations

with a plan towards establishing, if possible, a uniform policy among the conservation organizations of the United States interested in this project.

### *Gift*

The President called to the attention of the Board the latest generous gift of Will Colby to the Sierra Club. The gift was standing close by, a fine painting by William Keith, probably of Mount Lyell from the Lyell Fork of the Tuolumne. The Board expressed its appreciation to Will Colby for this gift.

### *Recess*

The Board recessed at 12:20 p.m. and reconvened at 1:50 p.m. at the call of the President, all being present who attended the morning meeting except Director Livermore.

### *Glacier View Dam*

Art Blake, Chairman of the Conservation Committee, explained in detail the background of the proposal by the Army Engineers to place a dam across the north fork of the Flathead River which would flood approximately 19,000 acres of Glacier National Park.

Upon motion by Bernays, seconded by Hildebrand and unanimously carried, the Board asked Blake, as Chairman of the Conservation Committee, and Walter L. Huber, as an outstanding authority on dams, to draw up a strong protest to the Corps of Engineers to be presented to the public hearing at Washington prior to Wednesday, December 8.

### *Tioga Road*

The President described former Superintendent Thomson's plan to route the Tioga Road through the Ten Lakes Basin north of Mt. Hoffmann. Park Service Director Albright insisted upon having the views of the Sierra Club. Through personal investigation of the terrain on horseback a general relocation of the road was thereupon planned, including a higher crossing of Yosemite Creek and avoiding the Snow Flat summit.

Brower spoke on the subject, pointing

out that there are many people in the Sierra Club and elsewhere who share Dr. Harold Bradley's opinion that plans made years ago should now be reappraised in the light of recent knowledge of the full impact of roads on semi-primitive areas. He asked (1) that articles pro and con reappraisal be presented in the *Sierra Club Bulletin* (pro by Bradley, con by Colby, and an editorial introduction); and (2) that the Sierra Club then await national reaction from members and other conservation organizations before taking final action.

Each of the directors then added to the previous discussion at the September, 1947, and September, 1948, meetings of the Board.

The following motion was thereupon offered by Robinson and seconded by Hildebrand: that it is the sense of the Board that controversy between two one-way roads and a single two-way road is inappropriate in the *Sierra Club Bulletin*, but the Board of Directors believes it desirable that articles on the subject of road standards in national parks be published, and there is no objection to the use of the Tioga Road as an example.

Upon discussion of the motion Robinson stated that it was his interpretation of the motion that debate should not be permitted on the details of the Tioga Road nor whether the standards of the remaining 21-mile portion of the road are to be brought up approximately to the standards of the remainder of the road. That basic decision is set, but discussion is still appropriate in an attempt to restrict the standards of the road so as to cause minimum harm to park values.

Brower asked that Dr. Bradley be permitted to speak to the motion; but there having been an hour and a quarter of debate, the President ruled that the agenda would not permit further discussion and thereupon called for a vote. The motion passed, Brower and Clark dissenting.

### *Rooms and Library Committee*

Al Weiler, as Chairman of the Committee, presented a written report showing the expenditures of \$1,182 on a budget of \$1,200 approved for providing extra clerical

cal space in Room 1044 adjoining the Club rooms occupied by the Sierra Club since 1932 in Room 1050 of the Mills Tower. An expenditure of \$500 had been made by the San Francisco Bay Chapter in refinishing the walls of Room 1050. Upon motion duly made, seconded and carried, the Board of Directors expressed its appreciation for the hard work of the Rooms Committee and Fritz Baldauf in making the improvements possible. The matter of additional finances that would be needed was referred to the Executive Committee with power to act.

### *Carl Inn Road*

The Secretary advised the Board that Dr. Bradley, as Chairman of the Subcommittee on Roads of the Conservation Committee, had been advised by the Superintendent of Yosemite National Park that the Public Roads Administration had set as first priority for Yosemite National Park the relocation of the Big Oak Flat Road from Crane Flat to Carl Inn. The Superintendent stated that the completion of the middle section of the Tioga Road had been reduced to second priority by the Public Roads Administration. Leonard felt that the park values between Crane Flat and Carl Inn were so important and the forest of heavy sugar pines and the small grove of sequoias were so important that the plans for any relocation or substantial improvement of that portion of the road should be carefully reviewed to try to reach a solution that would cause minimum damage.

Dr. Bradley had very carefully followed out the exact line of stakes of the relocation as surveyed by the Public Roads Administration and now considered to be the accepted plan of the National Park Service. He presented a rough map of the proposed relocation which showed that the new location would be considerably to the east of the creek, missing Hodgdon Meadow by several miles and the Tuolumne Grove of Big Trees by a mile or two. Some doubt was expressed whether the elimination of the road and travel through those two beauty spots was desirable.

Leonard pointed out that the proposed

relocation through such magnificent forest would do considerable harm there. He recommended that consideration be given to a location originally suggested to him concerning a route approximately from Crocker Meadow up Crocker Ridge to Crane Flat. This route would have the advantage that it would be through or on the edge of logged-over territory in the national forest where fire roads already exist, thus leaving the superb virgin forest on the other side of Crane Creek in its semiwilderness condition. The Crocker Ridge location also should give fine views of the peaks of the northern Yosemite, such views not being available from any other point on the Big Oak Flat Road.

After brief discussion it was agreed by all concerned that the matter was too important for quick decision and it was therefore continued in the Conservation Committee with instructions to keep in touch with the National Park Service.

### *Calaveras Grove*

Leonard reported as a member of the Board of Directors of the Calaveras Grove Association. A meeting had recently been called at San Francisco by the Calaveras Grove Association to coordinate the principal agencies interested in the protection of the South Calaveras Grove and adjacent sugar pine and ponderosa forest.

At that meeting officers of the following organizations were represented: the President and Secretary of the Calaveras Grove Association, three of the leaders of the War Memorial Park Association, the President and Secretary of the Save-the-Redwoods League, the Secretary of the Sierra Club, the President of the California Division of the Izaak Walton League of America, the Vice-President for California of the Federation of Western Outdoor Clubs, the President of the California Conservation Council, a director of Butano Associates, and a Wilderness Society council member.

It was agreed that the Calaveras Grove Association and the Save-the-Redwoods League would continue their campaign for contribution of matching funds. It was further agreed that the War Memorial



Park Association would take leadership in attempting to get direct appropriations from the State Legislature without the matching requirement for immediate purchase of approximately six hundred acres of sequoia and nine hundred acres of surrounding sugar pine and ponderosa pine in Unit 1 of the Olmsted Report and all of Units 2, 2A, and 2B of the Olmsted Report, connecting the South Grove with the existing North Grove of the Calaveras State Park. The Association has an eventual objective of approximately ten thousand acres, but is willing to work with the other groups on the emergency need of first acquiring approximately three thousand acres covered in Units 1 and 2 of the Olmsted Report.

The Sierra Club was expected by this group to use its abilities and influence in publicizing the importance of those areas and the need for their immediate protection. The efforts of the Sierra Club would be broader than any of the other groups in furnishing general support as strong as possible for private contributions and direct legislative action. The Federation of Western Outdoor Clubs and the Izaak Walton League would lend their support primarily to a national campaign for Federal help.

It was the sense of the Board that the Sierra Club should continue to assist this program as strongly as its abilities would permit.

### *Butano Forest*

Jack Barnard reported as a member of the Board of Directors of Butano Associates. He advised the Board that the failure of the San Francisco bond issue made the task of protecting the forest extremely difficult, even though a majority of nearly 100,000 votes was obtained. The Butano Associates will nevertheless continue their campaign and are holding a meeting of their Board of Directors November 30.

### *San Geronio Area Developments*

At the May 1948 meeting of the Board a three-page report with map prepared by a special subcommittee under the chairmanship of Joe Momyer with reference to

developments in the San Geronio Primitive Area had been referred to the Winter Sports Committee and the Conservation Committee for consideration and report to the Board of Directors at the September meeting. The Winter Sports Committee had not been able to complete its study before the September meeting and the Conservation Committee has not had an opportunity to act since completion of the work of the Winter Sports Committee. The matter was therefore continued in the Conservation Committee for study and report.

### *Olympic National Park*

Leonard, as a member of the Council of the Wilderness Society, reported receipt of a very recent letter from Irving Clark, another member of the Council and a member of the Sierra Club at Bellevue, Washington, reporting a very favorable newspaper release by Congressman Jackson, within whose district lies most of the Olympic National Park. The newspaper account indicated that Jackson would strongly oppose any further efforts to reduce the boundaries of the National Park and that he considered that the bills introduced in the 80th Congress had been ill-advised.

### *Far West Ski Association*

Clark, as senior Sierra Club delegate to the meeting of the Far West Ski Association, reported changes in the by-laws (see Sept.-Oct. SCB). Robinson had since drafted a letter pointing out that the legality of the action taken at the convention was not clear and stating that the resignation of the Sierra Club should take effect upon the amendment's going into effect. It was felt by many of the directors that the Sierra Club, as a conservation organization, could contribute a great deal as a member of the association by participating in the debate leading up to formulation of association policy, by bringing in the viewpoint of conservation and the relationship of other recreational uses of public lands. The President stated that he would request the Secretary to prepare the letter to the President of the Far West Ski Association and to the member clubs there-

of, taking into account Robinson's original draft and such other advice as the Secretary wished to obtain.

The President further stated that he felt that the entire question of Sierra Club policy with respect to skiing and winter sports should be considered by the Board at the next meeting.

### *Kings Canyon Road*

Brower, as special liaison representative with the Park Service on the matter of the exact location of the right-of-way across the Sierra Club property below Zumwalt Meadows in Kings Canyon National Park, reported that the latest communication and maps from the Regional Director of the National Park Service indicates that the Park Service is willing to deviate by no more than approximately fifty feet from their original location along the edge of the meadow near the river.

It was the sense of the Board that this proposal entirely missed the point of the objection of the Sierra Club concerning the impact of the road upon national-park values. The Park Service seems to have gone on the assumption that the Sierra Club is here interested only in the effect of the road upon its own property. A very vigorous effort is therefore indicated on a national scale to convince the Park Service that consideration of the precious scenic and other values in national parks is of far greater importance than theoretical standards of roads designed too much on the nature of high-speed commercial highways.

### *Mountaineering Regulations*

The Regional Director of the Park Service had presented to the Sierra Club for comment a proposed revision of the regulations of Mount McKinley National Park with respect to mountaineering in that park. The regulations attempted to specify in great detail the training, equipment, and activities of climbers within the Park.

Leonard pointed out that at the last meeting of the Sierra Nevada Section of the American Alpine Club, held about a month ago, a resolution was unanimously

adopted condemning prohibitory regulation of the National Park Service in any of the national parks and urging that the emphasis of the Park Service should be on instruction and advice through registration rather than regimentation.

Upon motion by Leonard, seconded by Brower and unanimously carried, the President was directed to advise the National Park Service that the Sierra Club strongly condemned regulations in any national park which gave authority to prohibit mountaineering.

### *Bulletin Sales*

Brower, as Chairman of the Editorial Board, reported that there was a demand for subscriptions to the *Sierra Club Bulletin*, but that these could not be financed at the present \$1.00 allocation from dues.

Upon motion by Brower, seconded by Dawson, and unanimously carried, the subscription rate for the *Sierra Club Bulletin* for nonmembers was set at \$2.00 a year. Upon motion by Dawson, seconded by Leonard and unanimously carried, it was provided that there should be no free list of the *Bulletin* except exchanges approved by the Library Committee and other organizations or persons approved by the Editorial Board.

### *Interim Meeting of the Board*

Dawson suggested that because of the increased activities of the Club agendas for meetings of the Board had become so long that it was difficult to obtain time for adequate discussion of all subjects. He therefore suggested that a somewhat more informal interim meeting of the Board of Directors be had during the six months period between the November and May meetings of the Board. He suggested a meeting of the Executive Committee at which all interested members of the Board would be invited to come at their own expense and without penalty under the by-laws for failure to attend.

It was the sense of the meeting that it is desirable to hold at least an informal meeting of the Board of Directors before May, 1949.

RICHARD M. LEONARD



ry regula-  
in any of  
at the em-  
be on in-  
gistration

seconded by  
ried, the  
e the Na-  
erra Club  
in any na-  
ty to pro

Editorial  
a demand  
lub Bulle-  
financed  
from dues  
seconded by  
ried, the  
erra Club  
t at \$2.00  
seconded  
carried, it  
be no free  
anges ap-  
ittee and  
approved

## ard

se of the  
o agenda  
become so  
a time for  
jects. He  
what more

Board of  
months pe-  
May meet-  
a meeting  
nich all in-  
would be  
pense and  
vs for fail-

eting that  
informal  
ors before

LEONARD

MBER, 1948